

**DEVELOPING A FUNCTIONAL PATIENT SAFETY
FRAMEWORK FOR TRANSITIONING HEALTH SERVICES:
A VISION FOR QUALITY MANAGEMENT IN A JORDANIAN ACUTE CARE
HOSPITAL**

Mahmoud Alja'afreh

This thesis is submitted in accordance with the requirements for admission to the degree
of
PhD

Faculty of Nursing, Midwifery and Health
University of Technology, Sydney

August 2009

CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP / ORIGINALITY

I certify that the work in this thesis has not been previously submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text. I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Candidate

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of a large, stylized 'M' followed by a cursive 'A' and a small flourish.

Mahmoud Alja'afreh

DEDICATION

I dedicate this thesis to my family. My wife Sana gave me extensive and continuous support in this endeavour provided me the space to think and write and took on the weight of domestic responsibilities for the family in a new country. I am also grateful to my children Tamer, Tala and Mohammad who have missed spending time with a father who has been busy with his doctoral thesis. I hope that one day they can understand and forgive me for this absence.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to acknowledge the active participation of AlBashir Hospital staff and the Quality Department Manager at Ministry of Health for their involvement in the project. I deeply appreciate the cooperation of all health workers, managers and patients' families at the hospital in Jordan who freely gave their time to be interviewed. Much credit must be given to the great assistance offered by my former supervisor Professor Doug Elliott and current co-supervisor Doctor Roslyn Sorensen. They supported, encouraged and gave me a chance to do an assessment course to be registered and work as a nurse in NSW which has given me insight into patient safety health care in Australia. This position has given me invaluable experience and the opportunity to participate in a quality health care accreditation process that was conducted in the facility where I was employed.

I also wish to pay tribute to my principal supervisor Professor Judith Donoghue and co-supervisor Doctor Roslyn Sorensen. I was very fortunate to have them work with me and assist me through my journey for the whole thesis. They were always professional and supportive of my work and helped me survive some of the difficulties I encountered in this doctoral journey. I would also like to acknowledge the scholarship given by the Dean of the UTS Graduate School, Professor Mark Tennant that enabled me to stay in Australia and complete this final semester. I am also grateful to the management of Mu'tah University that provided the scholarship enabling me to undertake research training in Australia. This experience has enabled me to develop and I will be a better mentor for Jordanian nurses and a staunch advocate for patient safety in the future.

ABBREVIATIONS (KEYS)

A&E	Accident and Emergency
AHCPR	Agency for Health Care Policy Research
AIN	Assistant in Nursing
AN	Associated Nurse
BP	Blood Pressure
C	Clinical
CCU	Coronary Care Unit
CGU	Clinical Governance Unit
CI	Clinical Instructor
CM	Meeting at Clinical Level
CPR	Cardio Pulmonary Resuscitation
CSB	Civil Service Bureau
CVA	Cerebro Vascular Accident
DON	Director of Nursing
Dr	Doctor
DVT	Deep Vein Thrombosis
EBP	Evidence-based practice
ECG	Electrocardiogram
EPUAP	European Pressure Ulcer Advisory Panel
FMW	Female Medical Ward
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GI	Gastro Intestinal
HIV/AIDS	Human Immunodeficiency Virus/Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome
I	Interview
ICPS	International Classification for Patient Safety
ICU	Intensive Care Unit
IDC	Indwelling Catheter
IOM	Institute of Medicine
JD	Jordanian Dinar JD = US\$ 1.41, AU\$ 2.32
JNC	Jordanian Nursing Council
JUST	Jordan University of Science and Technology
KPI	Key Performance Indicator

LOA	Liaison Accreditation Officer
MD	Medical Department
MMW	Male Medical Ward
MOH	Ministry of Health
N	Nurse
NDU	Nursing Development Unit
NICE	National Institute for Clinical Excellence
NPUAP	National Pressure Ulcer Advisory Panel
NSW	New South Wales
O	Observation
OPD	Out Patient Department
Org	Organisation
Org M	Meeting at Organisational Level
P	Policy
p	Page
PHCs	Primary Healthcare Centres
PHR <i>Plus</i>	Partners for Health Reform <i>plus</i> Project (USAID)
Pt	Patient
PU	Pressure Ulcer
QC	Quality Committee
QD	Quality Department
QU	Quality Unit
RAS	Risk Assessment Scale
RCT	Randomised Controlled Trial
RMS	Royal Medical Services
RN	Registered Nurse
SOP	Standard Operating Procedure
TOR	Term of Reference
UNRWA	United Nations Relief Works Agency
UK	United kingdom
USA	United States of America
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WHO	World Health Organisation

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP / ORIGINALITY	II
DEDICATION	III
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	IV
ABBREVIATIONS (KEYS).....	V
LIST OF TABLES.....	XIII
LIST OF FIGURES.....	XIV
LIST OF APPENDICES	XIV
ABSTRACT	XVI
CHAPTER 1: BACKGROUND	2
INTRODUCTION	2
LOCAL CONTEXT	2
THE HEALTH SYSTEM IN JORDAN	5
HEALTH FUNDING AND INSURANCE	8
HEALTH SYSTEM ISSUES AND STRATEGIES FOR IMPROVEMENT	9
NURSING IN JORDAN	10
IDENTIFYING A CONDITION AS A CASE STUDY EXAMPLE.....	14
MANAGING THE RISK OF PU	14
<i>Location of PUs</i>	<i>15</i>
<i>The international situation of PU prevalence</i>	<i>16</i>
<i>The incidence of PU in Jordan.....</i>	<i>19</i>
A FRAMEWORK TO IMPROVE PATIENT SAFETY IN TRANSITIONING COUNTRIES	20
AIM OF THE THESIS	21
SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY	21
SUMMARY	23
ORGANISATION OF THE THESIS	23
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW	25
INTRODUCTION	25
CULTURE	29
<i>Ministerial culture: philosophy of health care provision.....</i>	<i>31</i>
<i>Organisational quality management.....</i>	<i>32</i>
<i>Risk management strategies: supporting clinicians in developing a patient safety culture</i>	<i>33</i>
<i>Nurses' participation in organisational change</i>	<i>34</i>
STRUCTURES.....	36

<i>Structure of the clinical nursing role</i>	37
<i>Relational structures between medicine and nursing impact on patient safety</i>	40
<i>Organisational structures impacting on patient safety</i>	42
<i>Organisational governance structures concerned with quality</i>	43
<i>Ministerial level governance structure</i>	44
PROCESSES	46
<i>Identifying processes that recognise when patients can be harmed (risk assessment of skin breakdown)</i>	46
<i>Communication processes in patient safety frameworks</i>	50
<i>Multidisciplinary teams</i>	54
<i>Creating communities of learning and engagement: clinicians who understand their roles</i>	56
<i>Role functions</i>	56
<i>Evidence for best practice management</i>	57
<i>Evidence-based practice guidelines</i>	62
<i>Performance management: outcomes of quality care</i>	62
<i>The collection and management of patient summary data for the organisation that is transmitted to the government level</i>	65
HUMAN RESOURCES AND THE PROVISION OF SAFE CARE	67
<i>Provision of ongoing education for clinical staff</i>	70
PROVISION OF PHYSICAL RESOURCES	71
<i>Support surfaces for PU management</i>	72
<i>Renewable resources: products for PU wound management</i>	75
THE BEST PRACTICE CARE ATTRIBUTES WITH CHARACTERISTICS IDENTIFIED FROM THE LITERATURE	77
SUMMARY	79
CHAPTER 3: METHOD	81
INTRODUCTION	81
RESEARCH QUESTIONS	81
STUDY DESIGN	82
CONTEXT OF THE RESEARCH PROJECT	85
<i>AlBashir Hospital</i>	85
<i>Clinical structure</i>	86
<i>Medical Department staffing</i>	87
PARTICIPANTS	88
<i>Quantitative patient data for the PU survey</i>	90
DATA COLLECTION PROCESSES	92
<i>Establishment phase: Entry into the field</i>	92
<i>Data collection phase</i>	93

<i>Clinical data</i>	95
<i>Organisational data</i>	98
<i>Ministerial data</i>	100
INSTRUMENTS USED IN THE RESEARCH STUDY	101
<i>Interview questionnaire</i>	101
<i>Observational meeting instrument</i>	101
<i>Practice observations instrument</i>	101
<i>Incidence and prevalence recording instrument</i>	102
REFLEXIVITY	102
ETHICAL ISSUES	104
DATA ANALYSIS	104
SUMMARY	106
CHAPTER 4: FINDINGS	108
1. QUANTITATIVE FINDINGS	109
<i>Prevalence of PU at AlBashir Hospital</i>	109
<i>Incidence of PU at AlBashir Hospital</i>	111
<i>Conclusion</i>	114
2. QUALITATIVE FINDINGS	115
CLINICAL ENVIRONMENT	115
CULTURE	115
<i>Safety for patients and staff</i>	115
<i>Staff knowledge about risk assessment</i>	117
<i>Staff knowledge and skill in undertaking best practice risk management interventions</i>	119
<i>A model of safe patient care</i>	122
STRUCTURE	126
<i>Quality of care and patient safety meetings</i>	126
<i>Specialist nursing positions</i>	127
PROCESSES	130
<i>Specified clinicians' job descriptions</i>	130
<i>Performance review and feedback</i>	133
<i>The availability of best evidence guidelines</i>	135
<i>Effective written communication between the disciplinary groups</i>	138
<i>Effective verbal communication between the disciplinary groups and patients</i>	142
<i>An incidence monitoring system for PU</i>	147
HUMAN RESOURCES	149
PHYSICAL RESOURCES	153
<i>Physical resources are well maintained</i>	153

<i>Adequate renewable resources appropriately used</i>	156
PRESENCE OF KEY ATTRIBUTES OF BEST PRACTICE CARE AT THE CLINICAL LEVEL IN THE CASE STUDY SITE	159
CONCLUSION	161
ORGANISATIONAL ENVIRONMENT	162
ORGANISATIONAL CULTURE	162
<i>Leaderships and governance</i>	164
<i>Manager autonomy</i>	166
STRUCTURE	168
<i>Specific structures to implement a quality and patient safety system</i>	168
<i>Structural changes</i>	173
PROCESSES.....	180
<i>Manager position descriptions</i>	180
<i>Performance review of managers</i>	184
<i>A system of standards development</i>	185
<i>Effective written communication</i>	187
<i>Effective verbal communication</i>	190
<i>System to collect and manage patient summary data</i>	196
HUMAN RESOURCES.....	198
PHYSICAL RESOURCES	203
<i>Availability of physical resources</i>	204
<i>Provision of funding to maintain physical resources in working order</i>	206
PRESENCE OF KEY ATTRIBUTES OF BEST PRACTICE CARE IN THE CASE STUDY SITE AT THE ORGANISATIONAL LEVEL.....	208
CONCLUSION	210
MINISTERIAL ENVIRONMENT	211
CULTURE	211
<i>Patient centred philosophy</i>	211
STRUCTURE	214
<i>Specific quality department structures</i>	216
<i>Quality Unit meetings</i>	218
PROCESSES.....	219
<i>Managers' position descriptions and culture change</i>	220
<i>Performance review and feedback</i>	221
<i>Identifying, developing and implementing best practice guidelines</i>	223
<i>Effective written communication</i>	225
<i>Effective verbal communication</i>	228
<i>System to collect and manage patient summary data</i>	228
HUMAN RESOURCES.....	229
PHYSICAL RESOURCES	229

<i>Providing funds to maintain physical resources in working order</i>	230
<i>Adequate physical resources</i>	231
CONCLUSION	232
PRESENCE OF KEY ATTRIBUTES OF BEST PRACTICE CARE AT THE POLICY LEVEL IN THE CASE STUDY SITE AT THE MINISTRY LEVEL.	233
CHAPTER SUMMARY	235
CHAPTER 5: A PROPOSED PATIENT SAFETY FRAMEWORK FOR ACUTE CARE PATIENTS IN A PUBLIC HOSPITAL IN JORDAN	237
INTRODUCTION	237
CLINICAL ENVIRONMENT	247
CULTURE: STRATEGIES TO SUPPORT CLINICIANS CHANGE THE CULTURE	247
<i>Assessing risk</i>	248
STRUCTURES.....	250
<i>Ward level structure to support a patient safety culture</i>	250
<i>Re-organising the model of nursing care</i>	250
<i>Re-organising the nurse to patient ratios to support cultural change</i>	251
<i>Ward based practice development mini activities</i>	251
PROCESSES.....	253
<i>Clinical processes</i>	253
<i>Providing clinicians with specific feedback during a performance review</i>	253
<i>Sustained implementation of ward based mini activities starting with PUs</i>	254
<i>Evidence-based guidelines</i>	256
<i>Documentation and reporting</i>	256
<i>A data management reporting system for PU</i>	257
HUMAN RESOURCES.....	258
PHYSICAL RESOURCES	259
<i>Renewable equipment to manage PU</i>	260
ORGANISATIONAL ENVIRONMENT	260
ORGANISATIONAL CULTURE	260
STRUCTURE	262
PROCESSES.....	263
<i>Specific job description</i>	263
<i>Performance reviews</i>	265
<i>Outcome monitoring of KPIs</i>	265
<i>Communication processes</i>	265
<i>Data management and incident monitoring</i>	266
<i>Guidelines for practice</i>	266

HUMAN RESOURCES.....	269
<i>Stability of hospital managers</i>	269
<i>Reducing staff turnover</i>	269
PHYSICAL RESOURCES	270
MINISTERIAL ENVIRONMENT	270
IMPLEMENTATION	272
<i>Changing the culture</i>	272
<i>Improving clinical processes</i>	274
<i>Devising improvement mini activities</i>	275
<i>Communicating through teams</i>	277
<i>Managing data</i>	277
<i>Physical resources</i>	278
SUMMARY	281
CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSION	283
INTRODUCTION	283
THEMES AND RECOMMENDATIONS	283
LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY	288
SUMMARY	288
APPENDICES	290
REFERENCES	342

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1: Health sectors in Jordan with the number of hospitals, bed numbers, health care centres and patient eligibility.....5

Table 1.2: Pressure ulcer locations relative to position..... 15

Table 1.3: Incidence and prevalence of PU in the USA, UK and Australia 17

Table 3.4: Policy documents at clinical level.....97

Table 4.1: The one week prevalence results of PU by stages and gender 109

Table 4.2: The prevalence of PU by gender and age group from the snapshot survey in the two medical wards in a Jordanian hospital..... 110

Table 4.3: The one week prevalence results of PU by site and gender..... 111

Table 4. 4: The four week incidence results of PU by stage and gender 112

Table 4.5: The incidence of PU by gender and age group from the four week survey. 113

Table 4.6: The four week incidence results of PU by site and gender..... 113

Table 4. 7: The four week incidence results of PU by medical diagnosis and gender.. 114

Table 4.8: The presence or absence of best practice model attributes and availability in AlBashir Hospital at the clinical level 160

Table 4.9: Employees at AlBashir Hospital by professional group or work location .. 199

Table 4.10: The presence or absence of best practice model attributes and availability AlBashir Hospital at the organisational level209

Table 4.11: Contact list regarding data collection follow up between Sydney and Jordan218

Table 4.12: The presence and absence of best practice model attributes and availability in AlBashir Hospital at the ministry level.....234

Table 5.1: Cultural best practice attributes compared with their presence or absence in the study site.....240

5.2: Structural best practice attributes compared with their presence or absence in the study site241

Table 5.3: Process best practice attributes compared with their presence or absence in the study site.....242

Table 5.4: Human resource best practice attributes compared with their presence or absence in the study site.....243

Table 5.5: Physical resource best practice attributes compared with their presence or absence in the study site.....244

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1: Nursing workforce at male and female medical wards according to daily shift allocation.....	91
Figure 3.2: Schema of data collection.....	94
Figure 4.1: Organisational structure at AlBashir Hospital.....	170
Figure 4.2: Medical Department ward structure	172
Figure 4.3: Organisational structure of the Quality Directorate at MOH	215
Figure 5.1: Conceptualising of proposed organisational change of functional quality and patient safety framework of care fit for Jordan.....	246
Figure 5.2: Diagram representing the processes needed to get new evidence for practice applied in the clinical environment	268

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix 2. 1: Pressure ulcer management guidelines	290
Appendix 3.1: Participants with schedule of data collection and data codes.....	291
Appendix 3.2: Incidence and prevalence recording sheet.....	294
Appendix 3.3: Staging system	295
Appendix 3.4: Braden Scale for predicting pressure sore risk.....	296
Appendix 3.5: Arabic copy of Braden Scale.....	297
Appendix 3.6: Interview Questionnaire sheet 3	298
Appendix 3.7: Observation sheet (Meeting)	299
Appendix 3.8: Interview Questionnaire sheet 2.....	300
Appendix 3.9: Interview Questionnaire sheet 1	301
Appendix 3.10: Observation sheet (clinical practice)	302
Appendix 3.11: Letter of Approval from the Jordanian MOH	303
Appendix 3.12: UTS Ethical Approval.....	304
Appendix 4.1: Checklist of quality program.....	305
Appendix 4.2: Hospital quality members.....	307
Appendix 4.3: Quality assurance performance indicators	308
Appendix 4.4: Nursing job description by MOH.....	312
Appendix 4.5: The first quality committee meeting at AlBashir Hospital	321
Appendix 4.6: The second quality committee meeting at AlBashir Hospital.....	322

Appendix 4.7: Types of disciplinary actions used in Jordanian governmental organisations323

Appendix 4.8: TOR Nursing ‘In-charges’ with the AlBashir Hospital nursing manager324

Appendix 4.9: Nursing patient assessment sheet at AlBashir Hospital331

Appendix 4.10: Civil Service Bureau (Public sector employment department).....332

Appendix 4.11: Civil Service Bureau performance appraisal instructions333

Appendix 4.12: Civil Service Bureau performance appraisal form.....338

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study, conducted in a tertiary public hospital in Jordan, was to identify and critically examine existing attributes that were seen to be problematic in managing patient risk. The management of pressure ulcers (PUs) was chosen as a representative exemplar to focus the research. A case study design using both qualitative and quantitative methods was used to generate an in-depth account of safety and quality issues. Data were analysed interpretatively and the findings used to develop a proposed patient safety framework for patients in the acute care sector.

The main findings include an urgent need to begin the modification of the traditional hierarchical bureaucracy within the organisation and the disciplines, towards structures and processes that promote a multidisciplinary approach to patient care. Processes such as the provision of multidisciplinary evidence-based practice guidelines to reduce variation in practice standards, the implementation of multidisciplinary progress notes in patients' medical records to prevent duplication inaccuracies and a team model of nursing care are required and included in the proposed model. Improvements in the organisational culture are likely to be achieved by engaging clinicians in organisational decision-making structures and processes and providing them with performance feedback by developing an incident monitoring system. The instability of the hospital workforce makes the achievement of cultural change extremely difficult. Changes in the employment of staff from one centralised government agency to a system that enables managers to have more control of workforce employment in their organisations, with staff themselves able to nominate where they work, are recommended. Organisational managers also require more control in how funds are allocated to their organisations to allow them to formulate budgets and identify funding priorities within their organisations. The greatest impact on improvement will be achieved if reforms are concurrently implemented.

A proposed framework incorporating these recommendations as a way to improve patient safety in acute care has been developed for countries attempting health care

transition. The framework positions the patient as central to clinical care decisions and clinical process management, and links the three key levels of the hospital together, i.e. the clinical, organisational and ministry levels, as one interconnected activity. Such an integrated framework will facilitate the concurrent implementation of the proposed new structures and processes that research findings show are at the heart of patient safety.